

BSNL Management Services Recruitment Rules 2009

vis-à-vis DOT Rules

- Com. S Ratnasubramanian, Retd DGM

After nearly nine years of its formation BSNL has notified the Group 'A' recruitment Rules (though in PSU there is no classification like Group A, B, C & D) with the name "BSNL Management Services Recruitment Rules". There was great expectation among the absorbed executives and the BSNL recruited JTOs about the RRs. But their expectation is belied since the content of BSNLMS Rules 2009 is very much same as the DOT Rules which deprived the promotee source officers of their legitimate career progression.

Some may proclaim from the rooftops that it is a great achievement that due to their 'consistent efforts' "the Group'A' RRs" are notified and now all will become regular STS and regular DGM.

But what will be the reality? Let us compare the provisions in DoT Rules and BSNLMS

Issue	DoT Rules	BSNLMS
Direct Recruitment	At ADET	Management Trainee
Filling up	50% from outsiders by UPSC exam and 50 % from TES Gr'B' by selection in UPSC.	50 % from External by open Competitive exam. and 50 % from Internal qualified candidates by LICE
Interse Seniority In entry cadre	1:1 for outsider and Departl. at ADET	1:1 for internal and external at MT
Career progression	After 4 years of service including probation eligible to become STS	One year training and two years as Dy. Manager eligible to become STS
Scope for Group'B'	Has to come via ADET to become regular STS.	Can go direct to STS on regular basis upto 50 % of posts.
Filling up of unfilled STS posts	The STS posts remaining unfilled were filled by promotion from Gr'B' on holding charge/ adhoc basis	The posts remaining unfilled after filling up 50 % from SDE/AO source and from the eligible MT source will be filled by

		promotion from SDE/AO on adhoc basis
Inter se seniority in STS	The same interse in fixed in ADET continues	Interse fixed in STS. STS from SDE/AO Source and STS of MT source fixed on inter se 1:1
Further career progression to JAG	From the STS with 5 years of regular service	From the STS with 4 years of regular service
Method of Filling up JAG posts	By selection from the inter se seniority fixed in ADET	By selection from the interse seniority fixed in STS

Note: There are additional provisions for 'campus selection' and 'lateral entry' at all levels above MTs in BSNLMS. This implies that there could be direct recruitment at all levels above the MT level in addition to direct recruitment already available at JTOs and MT level. We must remember that those coming through 'lateral entry' route shall become enbloc junior to the available regular incumbents but senior to the future incumbents. Thus, they will always be on the head on the future promotees completely ruining their career progression.

It would be clear that barring the above most damaging provision of 'campus selection' and 'lateral entry' above MT levels. there is no much difference between DOT Rules and BSNLMS except that in DoT Rules the interse seniority between direct recruit and SDE source promotee was in JTS (ADET) whereas in BSNL the interse is in STS. Further in BSNLMS 50 % of STS posts can be filled by STS promoted from SDE source in regular basis. Ratio is the same 1:1 in both. Both rules provide for filling up of STS posts by adhoc basis. In both at present you have to wait for sufficiently long as adhoc STS to become regular STS.

Having seen the rules now let us compare the reality in DoT rules vis-à-vis BSNL rules.

Let us analyse the same for each group of stake holders, i.e., BSNL recruited JTOs, Divisional Engineers and Sub Divisional Engineers.

(1) For BSNL employees having the required qualification: The BSNL recruit JTOs

The direct recruitment at MT is exactly similar to the ADET recruitment that was available in DoT Rules. The entry level of ADET and MT is exactly

the same. In DoT the minimum qualifications for recruitment to JTO was I class B.Sc./B.E till 1996 and many B.Sc and some B.Es also entered as JEs/JTO. After 1996 the minimum qualification of JTO itself is B.E./B.Tech. Then why try to recruit another hierarchy at MT level with the same qualification and frustrate the career prospects of qualified JTOs?

It is well known that when the ITS is not interested to get absorbed and wishes to continue in deputations for ever, the DoT tried to recruit ADET even after 2000 and pump them into BSNL on deputation. It is because of strong opposition from one association i.e TESA, the move was thwarted. Now the same game is being played by the BSNL management.

The only solace is that 50 % of MT is open for internal qualified candidates which was not in DoT. But even in DoT many JEs/JTOs who were engineering graduates appeared in UPSC with age relaxation and became ADET in those days and went upto CGM/Member or even Director General. Hence this is nothing of a great bonanza to the qualified JTOs except that instead of competing with outsiders for 100% posts they compete with insiders for 50% posts.

The age restriction of 36 years for internal candidates along with the academic qualification prescribed and 4 years work experience in BSNL will show that the scope of internal candidates will be open mostly to Direct recruit JTOs/JAOs. The absorbed JTOs recruited in DoT with Engineering degree after 1996 may mostly be nearing 36 or crossed 36. Even if MT recruitment starts in 2009 only a few of them may be within the age but will not have the required age to avail the allowed 3 attempts. The SDEs might have already crossed the age.

This leaves the scope only to Direct recruit JTOs. This makes a provision for fast track promotion for them but to a very limited extent. Let us analyse further.

The total number of STS posts is 5400. The MT on promotion to STS will be filled upto max. 50 % of STS posts. That means maximum 2700 STS only can be from MT source. Now they have to serve in STS for a minimum of 4 years regular service to be eligible to become JAG. That means at any given time a minimum of 4 year batches of MTs will be in STS. This may become higher if the promotion is delayed by even 1 year say 5. But assuming that only 4 batches of MT occupy the 2700 posts at any given time their annual recruitment cannot be more than 650 at the maximum. Now out of this 50 % is to be ear marked for external candidates mean hardly 325 at the maximum will be for internal candidates in a year. **But in reality though**

the first recruitment of MT notified in 2008 and kept in abeyance showed 300 external MTs of which 50 are to be in finance this may not follow every year. The intake will be restricted for smooth career progression of the MTs. In effect it will limit the intake of internal candidates also.

Assuming equal number of internal candidates the maximum may be 300 per year. Now the direct recruit JTOs are recruited in the size of nearly 2000 to 3000 JTOs per annum. With the condition of 4 years service, what will be the small scope of opening 300 posts to them ? **Further there is also the clause in MTRR that the unfilled vacancies of internal candidates will be carried over to external source the next year. That means the availability of MT internal is further restricted.** Then what is the scope of BSNL recruit qualified JTOs ? The small outlet of appearing in MT internal is nothing but giving a pop corn to a hungry elephant.

What will be the career progression of the vast majority of BSNL recruit JTO who cannot get through the MT internal. Same plight that of the DoT – JTO. Wait for years to become SDE in LDCE or wait in long queue for SDE promotion under seniority cum fitness. Join the hapless absorbed SDEs in the long queue to STS. **Is it for that they joined BSNL, with high aspirations of entering the mightiest PSU ?**

So in reality what is the benefit BSNL recruit JTO will get from BSNLMS as different from the JTOs of DoT. Nil and nothing. The very same position.

(2) The Divisional Engineers.:

The next worst affected category is the DEs. What is the scope for their career progression in BSNLMS as different from DoT Rules ?

In DoT they served for over a decade as SDEs to become holding charge/ adhoc DEs. Again they served over a decade as holding charge DE/ adhoc DE. Many retired as holding charge DEs and a few were confirmed by UPSC as ADET at their fag end of the service and were fixed interse with an ADET who was just in middle school when they were holding charge DEs. With their age profile they could never become JAG. They superannuated.

So what difference it made in DoT between the DE who retired as holding charge DE and the DE who was made regular by UPSC and retired as DE only ? Nothing. The pay was the same. The designation was the same. The responsibility was the same. Their social status was the same. Even the rubber stamp they used was the same. There is no difference in rubber stamp as “holding charge DE” , “regular DE’. Both

used the same rubber stamp 'Divisional Engineer'.

The same scenario is now in BSNL for the promotee DEs. Though some may think that 50 % of the DEs will now be regular as compared to just a handful in DoT era upto 2000, what benefit they would get out of this ? Their age profile will show that a vast majority of the adhoc DEs getting regular will not have balance service to become regular DGMs. As the BSNLMS reads the first set may be given **adhoc DGM** by relaxation of service condition **as a one time measure**. That means they will not be regular DGM. But they were already officiating DGMs. What is the difference between officiating/looking after DGM and a adhoc DGM except that an officiating/looking after DGM is reverted for one day at an interval of every 90 days? The service as an officiating DGM or adhoc DGM does not count for your next promotion. For the next promotion it requires 5 years regular service as DGM. When he will become regular DGM ? After being fixed inter se with the 'to be recruited' MT and hence at the earliest in 2018? How many of our present day officiating DGMs or the adhoc DEs being regularized now will be in service in 2018 to become regular DGM? Again counting from 2018 will a single person have the balance service of 5 years after he becomes regular DGM? Then what is the difference?

What about the rest adhoc DEs who are made regular STS now but with their age profile will retire as DEs only ? What difference they have from being adhoc DEs or regular DEs?

But an optimistic calculation of becoming regular DGM in 2018 will further go on wrong side when the 150 lateral recruit DGMs join and rank enblock senior to the future promotees from DE/AGM source. It will only increase the woos of the promotee source DEs/AGMs further..

Thus in case of vast majority of adhoc DEs / officiating DGMs what they got from BSNLMS ? Very like the holding charge DE in DoT who was confirmed as ADET at the fag end of his service, exactly similar is their position. They get nothing fruitful. **The pay is the same. The designation is the same. The responsibility is the same. Their social status will be the same. Even the rubber stamp they use will be same.**

The pity is that the story does not end there.

Their entire service as adhoc DE and officiating DGM had been thrown to winds that they are now to appear in a DPC to become regular in STS. That is they are appearing in DPC for a post which they were already holding. Or in case of officiating DGMs they are appearing in DPC for a post which is

subordinate in rank to the one in which they are already there. Only because they were fit to hold charge as STS they were promoted as STS and that was also by a DPC by HQ of DoT or HQ of BSNL. Only because they discharged the duties of STS efficiently there were given officiating/looking after JAG. Now in the DPC their CRs for the period of their service as DEs/DGM will be the basis to decide whether they are fit to be DEs. Can there be a more mockery than this one ?

Is it clear that the BSNLMS Rules 2009 had not showered any blossom in the lives of the adhoc DEs/officiating DGMs and **instead it had just added insult to the injury ?**

Is it in any way different from DoT rules which ruined the career progression of the promotee officers ?

(3) The Sub Divisional Engineers:

And now let us now consider the plight of the SDE. Let us see whether at least this cadre will reap any benefit from BSNLMS as compared to DoT Rules. **At the end of the analysis you would come to know that he is the worst affected of all.**

Earlier in DoT one third of them became SDE in an all India competitive exam. in which the JTOs with five years of service and qualified in TES Group 'B' exam were permitted. And the rest were filled by TES Group 'B' qualified JE/JTOs. And after qualifying TES Group 'B' exam they joined the big queue in the eligibility list to become SDE and by the time they got SDE they had a service of over a decade as a JE/JTO. Some time it went upto 16 years. Now the qualifying exam is not there and it is by seniority cum fitness and hence the queue may be slightly bigger.

And after becoming SDE they served over a decade to become adhoc DEs. As adhoc DEs their plight in DoT is already described in the paras which analysed the plight of the Divisional Engineers and hence not repeated here. What they got new now in BSNLMS different to their state in DoT ? Can they become regular DEs when they are having sufficient balance service and that having been fixed interse with MT at STS level will they have any chance of becoming regular DGM ? Or is their future will be as bleak under BSNLMS as in under DoT rules or still worse ?

Now they see before their eyes that 50 % of STS posts are filled with STS executives of SDE source with regular status as against just very few in DoT. Great. But these STS who are now being made regular had served for

years, some over a decade as adhoc DEs before getting the regular status the scenario being identical to that under DoT rules. But is it only because that there was no so called Group'A' RR in BSNL for the past nine years and now as the great BSNLMS has taken avatar the SDEs of today stand a fare chance of becoming regular DEs earlier ?

Remember the total STS posts are around 5400 of which only 50 % will be filled by SDE source executives in regular status. Balance ? If any post is left out unfilled after filling it by MT source STS executives then it will be filled by adhoc arrangement in STS. OK. On date there is nobody from MT source. So 2700 will be regular and 2700 will be adhoc. Then again when a vacancy comes in STS you will first become adhoc then as and when the regular STS executive from SDE source retires you can become regular STS. That is so far you had stood in queues for promotion from JTO to SDE and SDE to adhoc DE. Now you join the third queue at its tail end for becoming regular DE from adhoc DE. The pity is at the time you join the queue in its tail end you will be above 50. When you reach the head end of the queue you will become regular DE ?. But at what age ? Again from that day of becoming regular STS onwards only your service in STS will count for your further promotion to JAG.

Now what is the time frame ? With 100% STS posts open to executives of SDE source you know how many years it takes for you to become adhoc STS. Now from then on it may take a few years to become regular STS from adhoc STS. It depends upon the retirement of regular STS. From the 2700 regular STS every year persons retire. From the first list of STS to be regularized the retirement will be heavier in the first 3 years since 2700 are made regular at a stretch. But subsequently since further regularization of STS will be based on the number of regular STS retiring it will not be much. So every year some 400 say may become regular STS. But if you calculate the age profile none will have a balance service of over 4 years to become regular DGM especially after fixing his interse seniority with MT source executive at STS level.

Not only that. Now all the 5400 STS posts are filled by promotion from SDEs. But if the MT recruitment which was notified in 2008 and kept in abeyance starts then after 4 years when the MT source executives are eligible to become STS and get promoted to STS your chance of filling the 2700 STS posts by adhoc will diminish. Every year some 600 MTs (300 MT external plus 300 MT internal) may jump the queue before you and every year the adhoc posts which are available now will reduce. **That means unless you stand a chance to become adhoc DE before 2014 by your present seniority then a vast majority of SDEs may just forget becoming even adhoc STS in their life which they were getting earlier**

under DoT rules or with no rule for the past 9 years in BSNL.

In DoT hardly 100 to 150 ADETs were recruited every year. The defective recruitment rules of DoT deprived the promotee source officers from becoming regular DEs and regular DGMs. But still it did not prevent them from becoming adhoc STS at least. All the direct recruit JEs/JTOs and even a few of JEs promoted from staff cadres as well were able to climb the ladder to become atleast holding charge/adhoc DEs, some of them even reaching the grade of DGM on regular basis. Now with the BSNLMS and the MT recruitment the chance of becoming even adhoc DEs will be lost for ever to many of them.

Of course BSNL may not recruit this much MTs every year. It will reduce the intake in order to have smooth career progression of the MTs. But even then to that much extent your becoming even adhoc DE is delayed. Every one of you can calculate even with an optimistic look what is there for you with your age profile with the BSNLMS Rules. You may not have even the adhoc STS chance which you had earlier.

Is BSNLMS in anyway better than DoT rules for SDEs? **Now say, is the BSNLMS has come as a spring to you or had brought a thunder as it is still worse ?**

On date you may be an officiating DGM, or an adhoc DE or a SDE or a JTO recruited by DoT or a BSNL recruited JTO. Think for yourself. Did the BSNLMS brings any blossom in your career progression ?

We could only remember an old story. A couple had a son and the son was dumb. He could not speak. They went to every doctor, prayed God so that their son could get his speech. Finally one day the son started speaking. But what all he spoke was abusing his parents in filthy language in public view. The parents thought better he could have remained dumb.

The same is the story of Group A RRs released with the new name BSNLMS. When it was not there every one thought that if it comes out their career prospects will be better. Now it has come out. But it is with such of draconian clauses that make every one's career more miserable than it was earlier.

Is there anything to rejoice in BSNLMS ?

oooOOOooo